

many Navajo poems, songs, and stories, challenging a “Western ideology overly fixated on reference” (p. 226), and helping the community to form an image of itself. Thus ideophony is part of an aural system that sustains Navajo nationalism.

Perley, the Maliseet graphic novelist, also transcends the borders of genre by representing stories in the multiple “texts” that together compose a graphic novel. “In the category of texts I include graphic images, framing devices, and type fonts. In short, it is not just the language that I am attempting to salvage; it is also the landscape, the stories, and the Maliseet peoples’ experience” (p. 198). Bringing these tools together, he creates an experience and, once again, places—Maliseet homelands—are indispensable elements of these experiences. “I do not

want members of the community merely to read the text. I want them to ‘experience the text,’ because place is critical as a meaningful part of the reading” (p.202). And by evoking experience, Perley seeks to perpetuate, to *provoke* more Maliseet storytelling.

Thus comes one answer to the question of what storytellers are doing with their stories: they are trying to provoke more stories. And—with varying degrees of success—what academics do is to aid in these provocations. The authors quoted above and the other contributors to this book have made a valuable contribution to the scholarly literature on indigenous language renewal. It should be of great use in graduate seminars and advanced undergraduate courses in anthropology, linguistics, and Native American studies.



## ***Hunter-Gatherer Behavior: Human Response During the Younger Dryas***

Metin I. Eren (ed.)

Walnut Creek: Left Coast Press, 2012, 281 pp., \$79 (cloth)

**Reviewed by Christopher Morgan**

Department of Anthropology, University of Nevada, Reno

The Younger Dryas (YD), popularly perceived as a 1,300-year-long return to glacial conditions at the close of the Pleistocene, is notable for its rapid onset, arguably extreme climatic effects, and contemporaneity with such game-changing developments in human prehistory as the proliferation of peoples and cultures across the Americas, the diversification and intensification of hunter-gatherer lifeways, and the initiation of the processes that led to animal and plant domestication at the dawn of the Holocene. It was consequently surprising to read Metin Eren’s introduction to this new edited volume, *Hunter-Gatherer Behavior: Human Response During the Younger Dryas*, in which he argues that the Younger Dryas was of little consequence to the hunter-

gatherer populations and behaviors then spanning the globe. David Meltzer and Ofer Bar-Yosef make similar claims in the volume’s concluding chapter. Needless to say, this perspective is strikingly counterintuitive, and if true, incredibly important to our overall understanding of human prehistory, the origins of the complex societies that developed during the Holocene, and the roles that climate change and ecological relationships play in the development of economic, social, and political behavior.

This volume addresses these issues (and ostensibly Eren’s claim) in eleven geographically-defined chapters written by many of the leading experts on YD archaeology across the Americas and Eurasia. The first two chapters following the introduction, by Tom Dillehay and Luis Borrero, respectively, focus on South America and set the format for the rest of the book—each starts with an overview of paleoclimatic and paleoenvironmental reconstructions from proxy records such as ice and pollen cores and then moves on to summarize archaeological research on Younger Dryas hunter-gatherers. Interestingly, indications of YD paleoenvironmental change in South America are at best equivocal and, perhaps not surprisingly, evidence for contemporaneous change in hunter-gatherer lifeways is scant (though I wonder if

this story might change as South America becomes as intensively researched as North America). In any case, these chapters best substantiate Eren's claim.

The story becomes more complex as attention shifts to North America, with a chapter each on California's Channel Islands, the Southeast, and the High Plains/Rocky Mountains. Evidence for sea level change off California's coast, vegetation succession in the Southeast, and glacial advance in the Rockies points towards the YD's effects on North America's climate and biota. Compelling evidence for contemporaneous culture change is similarly mounted in a fascinating chapter by Torbin Rick and Jon Erlandson on the initial peopling of the Channel Islands in the context of large-scale changes in marine and terrestrial ecosystems, a data-rich chapter by Scott Meeks and David Anderson identifying population decline in the eastern woodlands, and a thorough summary by Jason LaBelle describing the development and diversification of regionally-distinct lithic technologies on the Plains. Each chapter convincingly argues for contemporaneous climatic and cultural changes, with Meeks and Anderson, in particular, understandably equivocal about equating temporal correlation between climatic and cultural changes with causation of the latter.

More diverse patterns are seen in Europe, the Near East, and East Asia. Michael Jochim, while noting the complexity of the paleoenvironmental record in central Europe, argues that vegetation communities and hunter-gatherer adaptations reflect mainly continuity during the YD. Yet he also draws attention to broad-scale changes in forest cover and concomitant shifts in hunting and settlement patterns during the terminal Pleistocene. In contrast, Stella Blockley and Clive Gamble assert that deleterious YD climatic changes had a significant effect on the availability of large fauna across Europe. Using a robust set of radiocarbon dates as proxies for population, they convincingly argue that this substantially reduced the size and distribution of human populations. Equally assertive propositions are developed in Cheryl Makarewicz's chapter on the Near East, where she reviews a substantial array of paleoenvironmental studies pointing towards both change and continuity during the YD. Within this complex environmental context, however, she suggests the YD generally entailed harsh environmental conditions and, more importantly,

argues that humans responded to these conditions with important behavioral changes, in particular via greater mobility and by intensifying the use of small seeds. Finally, Joshua Wright and Lisa Janz provide a brief overview of Northeast Asia during the YD, arguing that conditions were then, on average, cooler and drier than now, but that due to dating problems, human behavior is very hard to reconstruct for this period; the proliferation of microblade technologies, however, arguably hints at behavioral changes during this time.

In sum, the YD's effect on climate and environment was indeed variable, but it is also clear that substantial environmental changes occurred, particularly in the northern hemisphere. Degrees of change in human behavior also varied, but to generalize that continuity trumps change is hard to extract from the evidence presented in this volume, particularly in North America. It would have been easier to make one's own conclusions in this regard, however, if a little more editorial work had gone into making sure that figures and associated font sizes were large enough to read and if dates had been presented more consistently (radiocarbon and calendric dates are used interchangeably, making the reader do the work of juxtaposing the different dating schemes used in the various chapters). Despite these quibbles, the volume as a whole is well put together, contains excellent stand-alone chapters, and makes a strong case that the stereotypical view of the YD as a profound and deleterious return to glacial conditions indeed needs revising.

On the archaeological side of the equation, it's harder to tell what we need to reconsider. Additional information, particularly from Africa, Australia, and Asia (developments in Japan and along the Yellow and Yangtze Rivers, for example, might shed important light on the subject) are needed to assess whether Eren's, Meltzer's, and Bar-Josef's claims regarding behavioral continuity truly pertain on a global scale (a chapter on the Great Basin might alter this story as well). Their generalizations, however, while appropriately challenging stereotypes about climate change and human prehistory, particularly during the close of the Pleistocene, reflect what some see as a frustrating trend in archaeology today—that of identifying variability without providing new ways of thinking about or organizing all that new-found variability. To that end, in our effort to move

beyond outdated dialectical thinking and simplistic unilinear evolutionary trajectories, have we also stepped away from making meaningful generalizations about human prehistory? Part of the disconnect here is probably a matter of scale (specifically, what counts as significant cultural change in hunter-gatherer societies?), but more studies, more data, and more inductive reasoning, all

called for in the conclusion to this volume, solve only half the problem—if the old ideas are stereotypes and need replacing, where are the new ones? In any event, these questions are certainly important to those interested in the human history of the terminal Pleistocene and in the relationships operating between climate, environment, and people, making this volume all the more pertinent.

